

March 8, 2023

The LEWISTON PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION met in the Community Development Department Second Floor Conference Room at 215 “D” Street. Chair Busch called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

Planning & Zoning meetings are recorded live. To view the full video, go to <https://livestream.com/accounts/11220190> and select Planning & Zoning.

I. CALL TO ORDER

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Michael Busch, Chair; Gabriel Iacoboni, Vice Chair; Kevin Kelly; Cynthia Ball; Kathy Branson; Maureen Anderson

COMMISSIONERS EXCUSED:

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT: Katie Hollingshead, Assistant Planner; Dawn Ortiz, Community Development Specialist; Aaron Butler, IT; Jennifer Tengono, Assistant City Attorney

II. CITIZEN COMMENTS

Community Development Specialist Dawn Ortiz provided the Commission with a copy and verbal summary of an email received from Noah Prescott. This document can be found under appendix A of the March 8, 2023 minutes.

III. APPROVAL OF FEBRUARY 22, 2023 MEETING MINUTES (ACTION ITEM)

Commissioners Branson and Anderson moved and seconded, respectively, approval of the February 22, 2023 meeting minutes. The motion carried 6-0.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE REASONED STATEMENT OF RELEVANT CRITERIA AND STANDARDS FOR ZONE CHANGE APPLICATION ZNC23-000002 BY DK HOLDINGS, LLC (ACTION ITEM):

Commissioners Branson and Anderson moved and seconded, respectively, to approval of reasoned statement ZNC23-000002. Motion passed 6-0.

V. PUBLIC HEARING AND SUBSEQUENT DELIBERATION AND DIRECTION TO STAFF REGARDING THE REASONED STATEMENT FOR CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT APPLICATION CUP23-000002 BY TAUNIA HOSKING FOR A DAYCARE CENTER, 13 OR MORE CHILDREN, AT 1827 GRELLA AVENUE (ACTION ITEM):

Chair Busch explained the public hearing process, opened the public hearing and asked for a staff presentation.

Assistant Planner Katie Hollingshead provided a verbal summary of the staff report with maps and photos so the commission can get geographically familiar with the area.

Commissioner Ball asked for clarification that the conditional use was to increase the number of children.

Staff Hollingshead stated yes.

Applicant Matt and Taunia Hosking, 1827 Grelle Ave, Lewiston, Id, owners of Auntie's Little Farm House Daycare, stated they have been in business for over 5 years with a group license. They have to turn families away repeatedly because they are not able to take more children unless they increase to a center. There is a very high need in Lewiston for daycares. They even have a waiting list; which parents are willing to wait over a year to get daycare. They help support the community by offering this service, because if parents are not able to have daycare allowing them to work how are these families supposed to put back into the community.

Commissioner Branson asked if the children are escorted to the school in the morning.

Applicant Hosking stated that either herself or her staff walk the children to school.

Commissioner Anderson asked if they also pick the children up from school.

Applicant Hosking stated that either herself or staff are at the school before school is released and are waiting for the children.

Caleb Brink, 721 7th Ave, Lewiston, Id, stated they are in favor of this conditional use permit. Their child goes to this daycare and it is more than a daycare, but more like a home. Their child is excited to go to Auntie's Little Farm House Daycare each day.

Charlie Zumwalt, 3603 18th St C, stated they are in favor of this conditional use permit. Her and her children love Auntie's Little Farm House Daycare and want it to stay open. They were not able to afford their previous daycare due to the transportation charges they were being charged. Auntie's Little Farm House Daycare does not charge this fee and the atmosphere is more like a home that provides learning and curriculum that enables the children to be prepared for when they enter kindergarten.

Nichelle Gilbertson, 1812 Cedar Ave, Lewiston, Id stated she opposes this conditional use permit. It was very difficult to hear Nichelle as she could not speak loudly. Staff did offer to read the letter she had submitted via email and she refused. Chair Busch did paraphrase what he was able to hear to confirm that she opposes the additional children be at the daycare.

Allisa Rudolf, 22950 Granite St, stated they reached out to 20 different daycares trying to find a daycare before they were introduced to Auntie's Little Farm House Daycare by some friends. She trusts Matt and Taunia Hosking to take care of her child and are worried that they will not be able to take their child that is on the way to this daycare.

Chantelle Southner, 1322 Cedar Ave, Lewiston, Id is in favor of this conditional use permit and stated Auntie's Little Farm House Daycare has been in operation for several years, there is plenty of parking to upgrade the daycare to a center. The Hoskings have made sure to meet all the City's requirements to become a center, they even take the extra step to spray their driveway to keep dust down. There have not been any noise complaints.

Rick Lundvall, 1826 Cedar Ave, opposes this conditional use permit. He stated that he has seen children over the current approved limit in the backyard already. His significant other works shift work and sleeps during the day, having over 20 kids and the staff yelling at the kids will make this difficult due to the noise. He is fine with the lesser number that has already been approved but does not agree with the increase.

Darren Tatton, 3529 6th St, is in favor of this conditional use permit. No matter where you are in the City you are going to get noise. Auntie's Little Farm House Daycare is only open until 6 pm. He lives next to the airport park and can hear kids until 11 pm sometimes.

Staff Hollingshead confirmed that all Commissioners present received the 10 submitted public comments provided in the packet. All Commissioners confirmed they did.

Staff Ortiz translated a voicemail from Ralph Rogers, 1830 Cedar Ave, Lewiston, Id who stated he was in favor of this conditional use permit.

Staff Ortiz also read in 3 emails received for public comment. 1 in favor and 2 opposing this conditional use permit. Please see appendix B for these emails.

Applicant Matt and Taunia Hosking, 1827 Grelle Ave, Lewiston, Id, stated the traffic does not bother the neighbor living off Cedar Ave as they only have one entrance to their home off Grelle Ave. As for the neighbor directly behind him, Mr. Hosking stated he drove around the block and stood in front of the neighbor's property and could not hear the children outside. Mr. Hosking stated that the daycare has a schedule and the children are not outside all day long and some of the children are infants and do not go outside. The Hoskings provided images taken from their backyard showing Mr. Lundvall's property; it shows that there is not much space for outside activities due to items placed on the property. Please see appendix C for these photos. The school does seem quieter

as it is close to 780 feet away. They provide a safe, clean and stable place for the children in their care. They want parents to feel good about dropping off their kids.

Commissioner Anderson asked what hours of operation does the daycare have.

Mrs. Hosking stated they are open 6am to 6pm.

Commissioners asked staff to bring up an aerial view of the lot so they can see the play area and surround area.

Mr. Hosking pointed out where the children play using an aerial map. He also pointed out that the play area is currently located behind the neighbor's shop, not the neighbor opposing the conditional use permit.

Commissioner Ball asked if the applicant has given any thought to providing additional noise buffering, such as shrubbery.

Mr. Hosking stated they are open to the thought as long as it is within reason.

Commissioner Kelly asked what the current height of the existing fence is.

Mr. Hosking stated it is 6 feet high.

After deliberation and discussion of relevant criteria, commissioners Kelly and Iacoboni moved and seconded, respectively, to direct staff to draft a Reasoned Statement approving CUP23-0000002 with the condition the applicant provide a reasonable landscape plan for additional sound mitigation with their business license. Motion passed 6-0

VI. STAFF-COMMISSION COMMUNICATIONS:

A. Query of Commissioners for March 22, 2023 meeting.

All current commissioners will be in attendance at the next meeting except Commissioner Branson and Anderson will not be in attendance. Staff Hollingshead stated there will be a public hearing at the March 22, 2023 meeting. There is also still an open seat for the Commission.

VII. ADJOURN

There being no further business, Commissioners Ball and Iacoboni moved and seconded, respectively, to adjourn. The motion carried 6-0 and the Planning and Zoning Commission adjourned at approximately 6:54 p.m.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED,

Dawn Ortiz,
Recording Secretary

Chairperson or Acting Chairperson
Planning and Zoning Commission

Approved this _____ day of _____, 2023.

Appendix A



Comments on New Developments in Lewiston Orchards

1 message

Noah Prescott <noahprescott@proton.me>

Sun, Mar 5, 2023 at 11:53 PM

To: "dortiz@cityoflewiston.org" <dortiz@cityoflewiston.org>

Dear members of the Planning and Zoning Commission,

In two recent meetings on February 9th and Feb 23rd, you approved zoning changes for two proposed developments in the Lewiston Orchards. While I am supportive of additional housing and approve of housing density, there are some additional items which should be considered in order to alleviate some potentially negative outcomes that may result from these changes.

A negative consequence I am concerned about is the undue burden these changes will place on the existing public infrastructure. While I am aware that the council did not believe undue burden would be added, I would like to present an alternate view for your additional consideration.

Both of these zoning changes are in the southeast corner of Lewiston. This area is primarily accessible through two options: Thain (and then to Burrell or Powers, depending on the development) or Lindsey Creek Road. In my opinion, Lindsey Creek Road is too far out of the way to be considered a viable option for most people, so I believe Thain will be the primary street used to travel to these new developments.

The locations proposed are approximately 1.5 miles from what could be considered "destination points" for residents. Destination points include grocery stores, meeting places, or small shopping venues. With a distance of 1.5 miles, it is assumed that all residents located in this new development will be required to drive to these destinations. These two proposals represent an additional 92 housing units. With the need to drive, this will result in a *minimum* of 92 additional cars injected into traffic, assuming only one car per household. As the average vehicle is 14 feet in length, Almost 1300 additional feet of vehicular traffic will be added to an already busy street.

There are solutions to this challenge, but it requires a different perspective in what our goals are for our community. Strong communities are built when we intentionally design them to allow for engagement. One way to do this is by creating "walkable areas." To quote the book *Walkable City* by Jeff Speck, "A good walk has to be **Safe, Comfortable, Interesting, and Useful**. It is not a good walk if it does not meet all the criteria." **Safe** means slow traffic or with other people. **Comfortable** means surrounded by trees or mid-to high-rise buildings. **Interesting** is defined by having other people around, or interesting scenery to look at. **Useful** means having a reason to walk. Walking allows us to engage in our neighborhoods, build relationships with others, and create connections. Not to mention the health benefits that walking brings.

We need to rethink the goals for how we build our communities, and there are a few things the Planning and Zoning Commission can do very quickly that will help strengthen our community into a *Strong Town*. There are some arguments to be made for a full-on zoning reform, but I believe we could start by replacing a good portion of R1 zoning within the core of Lewiston (Normal Hill) and the Orchards with a form- based, multi-use zone, similar to the new FIB along Main Street. The main reason for this is because we need to allow for single family homes to organically up-zone in denser, walkable areas. In addition, we need to allow small business to open in these areas so that people are able to access them through walking. Local businesses who are closely aligned with neighborhoods allow for the easy access of needs, in turn supporting small businesses.

Another option to improve our community is to remove parking minimums. Removing parking minimums has been shown to make it easier for local residents to create new small businesses in cities such as Sandpoint and Twin Falls. It's also incredibly wasteful, as that land does not financially contribute to either the business or to the city through tax revenue. I also want to add that for most large stores, 60% of the business's total footprint is allocated for parking. The former Shopko building in Lewiston has a plot size of 300,000 sq feet, of which 160,000 sq feet is parking. This land could be put to much better use; for example, an apartment building.

In summary, I propose that these zoning changes provide us an opportunity to rethink how we want to build our communities. I realize that it takes time to build these kinds of initiatives, but this is a great place to start. Let's strive for the goal of housing our residents in such a way that it enables them to live in walking distance from their main dwelling to destination points, sometimes called "15-minute cities." This will allow us to reduce the number of cars on the road, improve safety, and build tighter, more relational communities.

I hope this letter at least provides a new perspective. I will admit it's possible that I am misunderstanding the phrasing "undue burden on public infrastructure", but I would make the case that roads fit that bill.

Thank you for your time and all you do.

Sincerely,

Noah Prescott

Appendix B



Fwd: Letter from neighbor

1 message

Katie Hollingshead <khollingshead@cityoflewiston.org>

Mon, Mar 6, 2023 at 8:55 AM

To: Dawn Ortiz <dortiz@cityoflewiston.org>, Joel Plaskon <jplaskon@cityoflewiston.org>

Dawn,

Please add this email to the ones you will be reading into the record for the CUP on Wednesday.

Thank you,

Katie Hollingshead

Assistant Planner

City of Lewiston



T 208.746.1318 x 7261

F 208.746.5595

215 D Street

P.O. Box 617

Lewiston, ID 83501-1930

www.cityoflewiston.org

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Taunia Hosking** <ALFHdaycare@outlook.com>

Date: Mon, Mar 6, 2023 at 8:53 AM

Subject: Letter from neighbor

To: Katie Hollingshead <khollingshead@cityoflewiston.org>

Taunia

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Tara f <taralynnfowler29@gmail.com>

Date: March 5, 2023 at 1:57:53 PM PST

To: ALFHDAYCARE@outlook.com

To whomever it concerns

Our names are Clint and Tara Fowler. We live at [1908 Grelle Avenue, Lewiston Idaho](#). We are a few houses from Matt and Taunia's Daycare. We have known the Hosking family for many years. They are wonderful, hard working, honest, caring tax paying citizens. We are so lucky to have them as neighbors, but also with them providing an at home daycare for so many in need families in our area. The close proximity of being next to Camelot Elementary is wonderful for many working parents. Many are unable to transport their kids to and from school because of the demanding jobs we all have to take to provide for our families. This huge perk of being close to the school takes away worry for many parents. I have witnessed the teachers walking children to school. They impress me with the care, safety and watchful eye on the children. Its nice as a parent to drop your child off, knowing they are safe, and happy.

Living so close to their daycare hasn't caused any issues for us. We forget there is a daycare there. They keep it respectful of the neighborhood, with no issues. It is so hard to find care for many families. Our town could use more with the type of in-home care that is provided in this specific daycare.

We love having a daycare so close. I have family members that children attend here and they have nothing but wonderful positive things to report back. We find many daycare needs being met by many families in the valley by Matt and Taunia's hard work, dedication, love and care from their Daycare. Without their specific daycare many would be upset and misplaced. Our children are the most important job we have, this daycare helps achieve that goal of raising happy healthy children.

Thank you for your time,

Clint and Tara Fowler



Daycare 1827 Grelle Ave

1 message

Nikki G <n.gilbertson.091705@gmail.com>

Fri, Mar 3, 2023 at 12:58 PM

To: dortiz@cityoflewiston.org

I am responding to the notice of public hearing for increased amount of children at the daycare at 1827 Grelle Ave.

I am opposed to granting the permit for increasing the amount of children at the daycare business. This has a direct impact on this residential area, and my quality of life as this is where I can come home and relax in peace. We will see another increase in traffic, and noise, etc. Note that not all home owners work an 8-5 schedule.

I had inquired about the proposed number of additional children for the daycare business. I was told the amount for the increase wasn't provided by the applicant nor does the City put a limit on the increased number of children associated with the permit, which states 13 or more. It is my understanding the fire department is the entity who approves the number of children based on their requirements for the facility. This could mean a lot more children, traffic and noise.

This also will effect a larger area of homeowners not just ones at the 300+ feet from the property or the whatever the ordinance requirements are for notification (I don't know what the specific rules are for notification).

Thank you for your time.

Nichelle Gilbertson
1812 Cedar Ave.



Fwd: conditional use permit application CUP23-000002

1 message

Rick lundvall <luckyrick777@gmail.com>
To: dortiz@cityoflewiston.org

Sat, Mar 4, 2023 at 9:42 PM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Rick lundvall** <luckyrick777@gmail.com>
Date: Sat, Mar 4, 2023 at 9:39 PM
Subject: conditional use permit application CUP23-000002
To: <dortiz@cityoflewiston.org>



To whom it may concern;

I am writing concerning the daycare located directly behind my home ran by Taunia Hostking. Last time I was sent a notice it was a conditional use permit for up to 6 children. I disagree with the expansion of this day care for the following reasons:

- 1) This daycare is located directly behind my home. When the weather is nicer out the children are outside all day long. I have to listen to yelling and screaming all day long, not only from the children but from the staff as well.
- 2) My significant other works night shift as a nurse and sleeps during the day which is impossible at times as the sound of screaming children permeate my home.
- 3) We are unable to use our pool or do activities outside due to hearing the constant yelling and screaming. It is impossible to enjoy anything due to the noise level.
- 4) Ours is a neighborhood of retired/elderly people and it is a shame that this is what we have to listen too.
- 5) We have a elementary school a half of a block away and they are quiet compared to this daycare.

If it is this noisy with up to 12 children, which to our knowledge was only supposed to be up to 6 then what will it be like with 13+ children. I built my home in this area due to it being a quiet neighborhood, and the fact that this is a residential area, this daycare has no consideration to the people who live here. The noise starts early in the morning and doesn't stop until 6 in the evening I do not agree with expanding this daycare.

Thank you for your time,

Rick Lundvall

Appendix C



Fwd: Letter from our neighbor

1 message

Katie Hollingshead <khollingshead@cityoflewiston.org>

Mon, Mar 6, 2023 at 10:00 AM

To: Joel Plaskon <jplaskon@cityoflewiston.org>, Dawn Ortiz <dortiz@cityoflewiston.org>

The applicant has requested that these pictures be added to the record as part of his rebuttal to the letter submitted by his neighbor.

I don't know that I've ever had someone send me rebuttal photos, so I'm not sure how to proceed.

Katie Hollingshead
Assistant Planner
City of Lewiston



T 208.746.1318 x 7261

F 208.746.5595

215 D Street

P.O. Box 617

Lewiston, ID 83501-1930

www.cityoflewiston.org

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Matt Hosking** <hoskingholsters@outlook.com>

Date: Mon, Mar 6, 2023 at 9:08 AM

Subject: Letter from our neighbor

To: khollingshead@cityoflewiston.org <khollingshead@cityoflewiston.org>

Cc: Taunia Hosking <alfhdaycare@outlook.com>

Katie,

Please add these pictures to the record for the letter from Rick Lundvall.

This is his backyard, that he states has a pool, and they can't do outside activities in. He has no pool and the yard is one of the worst eyesores in our neighborhood. We've put up privacy net to keep noise down, which is minimal and to not have to see the disgust of his yard.

The only outside activities he does is drink and throw his cans around his yard, while yelling at his significant other into the hours of the night and blaring his music. We don't complain and mind our own business because that's the kind of people we are.









Matt Hosking
Hosking Holsters
Sent from my iPhone